# FREEMAN

REAL ESTATE SERVICES



& ASSOCIATES, INC.

132 NASSAU STREET NEW YORK, NY 10038 TEL: 212.732.4056 FAX: 212.732.1442

September 6, 2007

Hon. Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chairperson New York City Board of Standards and Appeals 40 Rector Street New York, New York 10007

Re: 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY 74-07-BZ

Dear Chairperson Srinivasan:

The Notice of Objections of June 15, 2007 for the above referenced Zoning Variance Application requested response to several specific questions regarding the Feasibility Study, dated March 28, 2007, which was submitted as part of the application for a variance for the above referenced property.

We provide the following response to these questions:

**Notice of Objections #30:** Please provide a full plan set of lesser-variance drawings that show compliant height and setback (objections for ZR 23-633 are removed) that seeks to accommodate CSI's programmatic needs and excludes the proposed tenant school space; the remaining floor area shall be used for residential use.

This Alternative Community Facility/Residential scheme (Plans set titled: AOR Scheme B Synagogue use & residential scheme, dated 8-27-2007) would consist of a new synagogue lobby on the ground floor, and community facilities on the second, third and a portion of the fourth floors, with a gross floor area of 14,123 sq.ft. The fourth, fifth and sixth floors would be three condominium units for sale with a gross residential area on the fourth and fifth floors of 8,854 sq.ft., and the sixth floor penthouse would have a gross residential area of 3,082 sq.ft. The total gross residential area, not including the cellar would be 13,648 sq.ft., which includes residential lobby and core.

The gross built area of this alternative would be 27,772 sq.ft., not including the cellar. The zoning floor area for this alternative would be 27,772. The residential sellable area is 8,593 sq.ft.

ΤT

Notice of Objections Response 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY September 6, 2007 Page 2

As described in Objection #35 below, the BSA has request that, for purposes of this study, market rate rents be assumed for community facility spaces. The analysis of this alternative, therefore, assumes market-rate rents for community facility space based on comparable rents in the vicinity of the subject property. Market rate community facility rents in the northern edge of Midtown, Upper West Side and Central Park West area were reviewed. Community Facilities that function as shared space, and individual units were used. As identified in Exhibit B, adjusted rents are in the \$29.93 to \$49.48/sq.ft. range for comparable community facilities, with an average of \$39.61/sq.ft.

For purposes of this analysis \$40/sq.ft. has been used for market rate community facility rentals.

This development program is referred to as the "Alternative As of Right Community Facility/Residential Development".

<u>Notice of Objections #35</u>: Although it is recognized that Congregation Shearith Israel has not-for-profit status, for the purpose of this study, please ascribe standard market-rate rents for community facility space based on comparable rents in the vicinity of the subject site for both the as-of-right and proposed scenarios.

Notice of Objection #35 requires analysis of a revised as of right development alternative, as well as, analysis of a revised proposed development alternative.

a) Revised As of Right Community Facility/Residential Development

As requested by the Board, we have provided an analysis of the Revised As of Right Development (Plans set titled: AOR - Scheme A (Original), dated 8-28-2007), which would consist of a new synagogue lobby on the ground floor, and community facilities on the second through fourth floors, with a gross floor area of 18,134 sq.ft. On the fifth and sixth floors there would be two condominium units for sale with a gross residential area on the fifth and sixth floors of 7,594 sq.ft. The total gross residential area, not including the cellar would be 9,638 sq.ft., and includes the lobby and core areas of the residential portion of the development.

The gross built area of this alternative would be 27,772 sq.ft. not including the cellar. The zoning floor area for this alternative would be 27,772. The residential sellable area is 5,316 sq.ft.

Market rate community facilities rentals, as was described above, were assumed for this development. For purposes of this analysis \$40/sq.ft. has been used for market rate community facility rentals.

TT

This development program is referred to as the "Revised As of Right Community Facility/Residential Development".

T

Notice of Objections Response 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY September 6, 2007 Page 3

## b) Revised Proposed Development

n

The Revised Proposed Development alternative (Plans set titled Proposed Scheme, dated 8-28-2007) would consist of new construction of an eight-story plus penthouse mixed use building on lot 37 with the synagogue remaining untouched on the ground floor. The new development consists of a new synagogue lobby on the ground floor, and community facility space on floors two through four. Floors five through eight and the penthouse would be for sale condominium units. There would be a total of five residential units.

The gross built area of this alternative would be 42,962 sq.ft., not including the cellar. The zoning floor area for this alternative would be 42,962 sq.ft. The total gross residential area, which includes residential lobby and core but does not include the cellar, would be 22,907 sq.ft. The residential sellable area is 14,980 sq.ft.

Market rate community facilities rentals, as was described above, were assumed for this development. For purposes of this analysis \$40/sq.ft. has been used for market rate community facility rentals.

This development program is referred to as the "Revised Proposed Development".

<u>Notice of Objections #37:</u> Provided that the alleged hardship claim for the development site (Lot 36) is an inability to accommodate CSI's programmatic needs on Lot 37 please analyze a complying, fully residential development on Lot 36 as requested with Objection #31. This analysis is requested for the purposes of gauging what the economic potential of the development site would be without the alleged hardship.

The As of Right Residential F.A.R. 4.0 Development alternative (Plans set titled: AOR – Scheme C Residential Scheme, dated 8-28-2007) consists of new construction of a six-story residential building on lot 37 with the synagogue remaining untouched. The new development consists of a ground floor residential and synagogue lobby and core, and floors 2-6 would be for sale condominium units. There will be a total of five residential units. The total gross residential area, not including the cellar would be 25,642 sq.ft., which includes residential lobby and core.

The gross built area of this alternative would be 25,642 sq.ft., not including the cellar. The zoning floor area for this alternative would be 25,642 sq.ft. The residential sellable area is 15,883 sq.ft. This development program is referred to as the "As of Right Residential F.A.R. 4.0".

IΓ

#### Economic Analysis

In order to analyze and compare the economic characteristics of the four alternatives in response to objection #30, #35, and #37, as described above, we have prepared the attached Schedule A1: Analysis Summary; Schedule A2: Analysis Summary – Capitalized Value of Market Rate Classroom Space; Schedule B: Projected Development Costs; and Schedule C1-C4: Pricing Schedules.

The analyses incorporate the revised construction cost estimates provided by McQuilkin and Associates. The estimates are attached as Exhibit A to this letter. No construction costs related to development of the community facilities have been included.

All other assumptions are the same as those described in the Economic Analysis Report, dated March 28, 2007.

a) Alternative As of Right Community Facility/Residential Development (*Objection #30*)

The Feasibility Analysis estimated the net project value to be \$20,624,000. This amount is the sum of residential condominium unit sales, less sales commissions, plus the capitalized value of the market rate community facility space, which as shown in the attached Schedule A2, is \$2,133,000. The total required investment, including estimated Property Value, base construction costs, soft costs and carrying costs during the sales period for the Alternative As of Right Residential is estimated to be \$28,847,000. As shown in Schedule A, the development of the Alternative As of Right Residential Alternative would result in an annualized **capital loss of \$4,478,000**.

b) Revised As of Right Community Facility/Residential Development (Objection #35)

As shown in the attached Schedule A, the Feasibility Analysis estimated the project value to be the sum of residential condominium unit sales, less sales commissions. Consideration of the economic feasibility of condominium projects is typically based on the potential profit generated from the sale of apartment units and other sources, on a an annualized basis. Profit is the amount available for distribution to investors after all project expenses incurred in the development and sale of units are deducted from gross revenues. "Annualized Return on Total Investment" is measured by dividing the estimated annualized project profit by the total investment in the project.

Schedule A2 identifies the projected income and expenses for the market rate community facility space. A capitalization rate of 9%, which would be required to provide a minimum reasonable return on and return of capital was assumed. The Capitalized Value determined by the analysis for community facility space in the Revised As of Right Alternative is \$3,433,000.

1 T

TT -

Notice of Objections Response 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY September 6, 2007 Page 5

The Feasibility Analysis estimated the net project value to be \$14,820,000. This amount is the sum of residential condominium unit sales, less sales commissions, plus the capitalized value of the community facility space. The total investment required, including estimated Property Value, base construction costs, soft costs and carrying costs during the sales period for the Revised As of Right Development is estimated to be \$28,139,000. As shown in Schedule A, the development of the Revised As of Right Development would result in an annualized **capital loss of \$7,064,000.** 

c) Revised Proposed Development (*Objection #35*)

The Feasibility Analysis estimated the net project value to be \$39,556,000. This amount is the sum of residential condominium unit sales, less sales commissions, plus the capitalized value of the community facility space, which as shown in the attached Schedule A2, space is \$4,056,000. The total investment, including estimated Property Value, base construction costs, soft costs and carrying costs during the sales period for the Revised Proposed Development is estimated to be \$33,689,000.

As shown in Schedule A, the development of the Revised Proposed Development would provide an Annualized Return on Total Investment of 6.59%. We note that this return is not significantly higher than the previous return of 6.55%. This results from the assumption that the community facility areas will be rented at market rate. In fact, were the project to be undertaken today, as the proforma analysis assumes, the value of the project would be constrained by the fact that the community facility would produce no income and the lower return of 6.55% would be a more accurate reflection of the actual conditions.

d) As of Right Residential F.A.R. 4.0 Development (Objection #37)

The Feasibility Analysis estimated the net project value to be \$33,018,000. This amount is the sum of total estimated gross sales proceeds, less sales commissions. The total investment, including estimated Property Value, base construction costs, soft costs and carrying costs during the sales period for the As of Right Residential F.A.R 4.0 Development is estimated to be \$37,388,000. As shown in Schedule A, the development of the As of Right Residential F.A.R 4.0 Development would result in an annualized **capital loss of \$2,313,000**.

The Revised As of Right Residential Development, Alternative As of Right Residential Development and As of Right Residential F.A.R. 4.0 Development would each result in an annualized loss. The return provided by the Revised Proposed Development would provide 6.59% return on investment. The return provided by the Revised Proposed Development, in this case, therefore, would be considered acceptable.

T

° 1 T

Notice of Objections Response 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY September 6, 2007 Page 6

**Notice of Objection #36**: It is noted that all comparable properties analyzed to determine the subject site's value (Schedule C, Page10-12) are all downward adjusted for "inferior zoning" (the subject site has split zoning – R8B and R10A – and the comparable are all located in R8 or R8 equivalent districts). Please note that for developments in contextual districts, each portion of the zoning lot shall be regulated by the height and setback applicable to the district in which such portion of the zoning lot is located. Further, it is noted that the subject site is located within a historic district which applies further regulation on the height of any development of this site. Given this information regarding height and setback controls, it does not appear that additional floor area above 4.0 FAR could be utilized on this site (please note that the as-of-right plans show an FAR of 3.23 or 5,513.60 sq.ft. on the R10A zoned portion of Lot 36). Therefore, it does not appear that the subject site's partial location within a 10.0 FAR district (R10A) should warrant any downward adjustment for comparable properties zoned R8, R8B, or C6-2A. Please revise this analysis.

Consideration of the comparable vacant properties submitted in Schedule C of the original report adjusted the properties upward, not downward for zoning as stated in the Notice of Objections. These adjustments were made in order to provide an equal comparison of the properties to the subject. In the valuation of the subject property, we examined the entire lot, which includes the synagogue. Since the application is based on the merging of two lots, and the majority of the merged lot is in the R10A zoning district, in order to provide the most accurate acquisition cost, it is necessary to assign value to the full potential developable area of the subject property. Therefore, the acquisition based on \$500 per sq.ft. is appropriate.

I T

Please feel free to call me if you have any further questions.

Sincerely,

Jack Freeman

#### SCHEDULE A: ANALYSIS SUMMARY - CONDOMINIUM USE

	ALTERNATIVE AS OF RIGHT CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT	REVISED AS OF RIGHT CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT	REVISED PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT	ALL RESIDENTIAL F.A.R. 4.0
BUILDING AREA (SQ.FT.)	aya 79 ti Bibbili ma yan 179 ti Hamaya Bit L			
BUILT RESIDENTIAL AREA SELLABLE AREA	11,936 8,593	7,5 <mark>94</mark> 5,316	20,863 14,980	25,642 15,883
CAPITAL INVESTMENT SUMMARY				
ACQUISITION COST HOLDING & PREP. COSTS BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS SOFT CONSTRUCTION COSTS	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$4,249,000 \$5,080,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$3,722,000 \$4,919,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$7,488,000 \$6,594,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$10,831,000 \$6,873,000
	\$28,273,000	\$27,585,000	\$33,026,000	\$36,648,000
PROJECT VALUE				<u></u>
SALE OF UNITS (less) SALES COMMISSIONS CAPITALIZED VALUE OF COMMUNITY FACILITIES EST. NET PROJECT VALUE	\$19,671,000 6% (\$1,180.000) \$2,133,000 \$20,624,000	\$12,114,000 (\$727,000) \$3,433,000 \$14,820,000	\$37,766,000 (\$2,266,000) \$4,056,000 \$39,556,000	\$35,126,000 (\$2,108,000) NA \$33,018,000
PROJECT INVESTMENT	+20,021,000	¥14,020,000	400,000,000	400,010,000
ACQUISITION COST HOLDING & PREP. COSTS BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS SOFT CONSTRUCTION COSTS CARRYING COSTS DURING SALES PERIOD	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$4,249,000 \$5,080,000 \$574,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$3,722,000 \$4,919,000 \$554,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$7,488,000 \$6,594,000 \$663,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$10,831,000 \$6,873,000 \$740,000
EST. TOTAL INVESTMENT	\$28,847,000	\$28,139,000	\$33,689,000	\$37,388,000
RETURN ON INVESTMENT	\$20,624,000	\$14,820,000	\$39,556,000	\$33,018,000
(less)EST.TOTAL INVESTMENT (less) EST.TRANSACTION TAXES	(\$28,847,000) (\$359,000)	(\$28,139,000) (\$221,000)	(\$33,689,000) (\$689,000)	(\$37,388,000) (\$641,000)
EST.PROFIT (loss)	(\$8,582,000)	(\$13,540,000)	\$5,178,000	(\$5,011,000)
DEVELOPMENT/SALES PERIOD (MONTHS)	23	23	28	26
ANNUALIZED PROFIT (loss)	(\$4,478,000)	(\$7,064,000)	\$2,219,000	(\$2,313,000)
RETURN ON TOTAL INVESTMENT	0.00%	0.00%	15.37%	0.00%
ANNUALIZED RETURN ON TOTAL INVESTMENT	0.00%	0.00% =======	6.59% ======	0.00% =======

NOTE : ALL \$ FIGURES ROUNDED TO NEAREST THOUSAND

------ I--

-----

----

ECONOMIC ANALYSIS 10 WEST 70TH STREET NEW YORK, NY SEPTEMBER 6, 2007 PAGE 8

## SCHEDULE A2 : CAPITALIZED VALUE OF MARKET RATE COMMUNITY FACILITY

	ALTERNATIVE	REVISED	
	AS OF RIGHT CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT	AS OF RIGHT CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT	REVISED PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT
BUILDING AREA (SQ.FT.)			
RENTABLE COMMUNITY FACILITY AREA	8,500	12,510	14,430
CAPITAL INVESTMENT SUMMARY			
ACQUISITION COST HOLDING & PREP. COSTS BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS SOFT CONSTRUCTION COSTS	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$4,249,000 \$5,080,000	\$18,944,000 \$0 \$3,722,000 \$4,919,000	\$18,944,300 \$0 \$7,488,000 \$6,594,000
	\$28,273,000	\$27,585,000	\$33,026,300
INCOME AND EXPENSES			*****************
CLASSROOM AREA INCOME	\$340,000	\$500,000	\$577,000
GROSS INCOME (less)VACANCY (@ 10%)	\$340,000 (\$34,000)	\$500,000 (\$50,000)	\$577,000 (\$58,000)
EFFECTIVE INCOME	\$306,000	\$450,000	\$519,000
(Iess)M&O EXPENSES (Iess)WATER & SEWER (Iess)R.E. TAXES	(\$58,000) \$0 (\$56,000)	(\$85,000) \$0 (\$56,000)	(\$98,000) \$0 (\$56,000)
NET OPERATING INCOME	\$192,000	\$309,000	\$365,000
CAPITALIZED VALUE OF NOI @	9% \$2,133,000	\$3,433,000	\$4,056,000

NOTE : ALL \$ FIGURES ROUNDED TO NEAREST THOUSAND

------

#### ECONOMIC ANALYSIS 10 WEST 70TH STREET NEW YORK, NY SEPTEMBER 6, 2007 PAGE 9

## SCHEDULE B : DEVELOPMENT COSTS

	c	LTERNATIVE AS OF RIGHT F/RESIDENTIAL EVELOPMENT	REVISED AS OF RIGHT CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT	REVISED PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT	ALL RESIDENTIAL F.A.R. 4.0
DEVELOPMENT COST SUMMARY	_				
ACQUISITION COSTS		\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000	\$18, <del>9</del> 44,000
HOLDING & PREP. COSTS:		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS TENANT FIT-OUT COSTS		\$4,249,000 \$0	\$3,722,000 \$0	\$7,488,000 0	\$10,831,000 \$0
EST.SOFT COSTS		\$5,080,000	\$4,919,000	\$6,594,000	\$6,873,000
EST. TOTAL DEV.COSTS		\$28,273,000	\$27,585,000	\$33,026,000	\$36,648,000
ACQUISITION COSTS :	***********	▝▋▞▔▋▋Ҁ▘▋▞▝▋₽▋▙▖		╤┓╤╡╧┱╉┱┎╼╼┲╼╼┻══╼╼╼	▋▔▋▝▝▝▝▋▋▋▆▋▆▋
Land Purchase Price		\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000
TOTAL LAND VALUE		\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000	\$18,944,000
HOLDING & PREP. COSTS:		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS :		\$4,249,000	\$3,722,000	\$7,488,000	\$10,831,000
EST.CONST.LOAN AMOUNT :		\$21,205,000	\$20,689,000	\$24,770,000	\$27,486,000
EST.CONST.PERIOD(MOS):		20	20	24	18
EST. SOFT COSTS :					
Builder's Fee/Developer's Profit	3.00%	\$848,000	\$828,000	\$991,000	\$1,099,000
Archit.& Engin. Fees	8.00%	\$340,000	\$298,000	\$599,000	\$866,000
Bank Inspect.Engin.		\$12,000	\$12,000	\$34,000	\$12,000
Construction Management	5.00%	\$212,000	\$186,000	\$300,000	\$542,000
Inspections, Borings & Surveys		<b>A</b> T	•		<b>#</b> 5 and
Laboratory Fees	LS	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000
Soil Investigation	LS '	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000 \$5,000	\$10,000
Preliminary Surveys	LS	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000 \$10,000	\$5,000 \$10,000
Ongoing Surveys Environmental Surveys/Reports	LS LS	\$10,000 \$2,000	\$10,000 \$2,000	\$2,000	\$2,000
Controlled Inspection Fees	LS	\$45,000	\$45,000	\$45,000	\$45,000
Legal Fees	LQ	*13,000	¥13,000	410,000	<b>\$</b> 10,000
Dev.Legal Fees		\$150,000	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$150,000
Con.Lender Legai		\$64,000	\$62,000	\$62,000	\$82,000
End Loan Legal		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$(
Permits & Approvals					
D.O.B. Fees	25.53%	\$126,000	\$125, <b>0</b> 00	\$147,000	\$153,000
Cond/Co-op Offering Plan		\$30,000	\$30,000	\$30,000	\$30,000
Other		\$40,000	\$40,000	\$40,000	\$40,000
Accounting Fees		\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000
Consultant Fees		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$(
Appraisal Fees		\$8,000	\$8,000	\$8,000	\$8,000
Marketing/Pre-Opening Expenses		•	••	••	•
Rental Commissions	25.00%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$(
Sales Expenses & Advertising Financing and Other Charges		\$198,000	\$198,000	\$198,000	\$198,000
	9.50%	\$1,679,000	\$1,638,000	\$2,353,000	\$1,958,000
Con.Loan Int. @ Loan Rate = Rent-up Loan Int. @ Loan Rate =	9.50% 7.00%	\$1,679,000 \$0	\$1,638,000	\$2,353,000 \$0	ຈາ,ອບດ,ບບ \$(
Con.Lender Fees	1.00%	\$212,000	\$207,000	\$248,000	\$275,000
End Loan Fee	1.00%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2.10,000
Construction Real Estate Tax		\$334,000	\$334,000	\$445,000	\$334,000
Rent-up Real Estate Tax		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$
Title Insurance	0.33%	\$93,000	\$91,000	\$109,000	\$121,00
Mtge.Rec.Tax	2.75%	\$583,000	\$569,000	\$681,000	\$756,000
Construction Insurance	1.00%	\$64,000	\$56,000	\$112,000	\$162,00
Water and Sewer		\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000
Other		\$0	<b>\$</b> 0	\$0	\$

NOTE : ALL \$ FIGURES ROUNDED TO NEAREST THOUSAND

T

Freeman/Frazier &	& Associates, Inc.
Date	: September 6, 2007
Property	: 10 West 70th Street
Block, Lot	: Blk 1122, Lot 37
Total Land Area	: 6,472 sq.ft.
Zone	: R8B & R10A
Page 10	

#### Outdoor Space **Price/SF** Floor Area Price Four \$7,291,325 \$2,225 0 3,277 Five \$7,537,100 3,277 \$2,300 0 Six 2,039 \$4,842,625 \$2,375 0 8,593 \$2,289 \$19,671,050 Total

# Schedule C1: Alternative As of Right - Residential Condominium Pricing

Schedule C2: Revised As of Right - Residential Condominium Pricing

Floor	Area	Price	Price/SF	Outdoor Space
Five	3,277	\$7,373,250	\$2,250	0
Six	2,039	\$4,740,675	\$2,325	0
Total	5,316	\$12,113,925	\$2,279	

11

Ľ

Freeman/Frazier & Associates, Inc.					
Date	: September 6, 2007				
Property	: 10 West 70th Street				
Block, Lot	: Blk 1122, Lot 37				
Total Land Area	: 6,472 sq.ft.				
Zone	: R8B & R10A				
Page 11					

|-----

Floor	Area	Price	Price/SF	Outdoor Space
Five	3,277	\$7,537,100	\$2,300	0
Six	3,277	\$7,782,875	\$2,375	0
Seven	3,277	\$8,110,575	\$2,475	0
Eight	3,277	\$8,765,975	\$2,675	0
PH	1,872	\$5,569,200	\$2,975	0
Total	14,980	\$37,765,725	\$2,521	· ·

Schedule C3: Proposed Residential Condominium Pricing

Schedule C4: As of Right - Residential F.A.R 4.0 Condominium Pricing

1

Floor	Area	Price	Price/SF	Outdoor Space
Two	3,461	\$7,181,575	\$2,075	0
Three	3,461	\$7,441,150	\$2,150	0
Four	3,461	\$7,700,725	\$2,225	0
Five	3,461	\$7,960,300	\$2,300	0
Six	2,039	\$4,842,625	\$2,375	0
Total	15,883	\$35,126,375	\$2,212	

Exhibit A

Т

I

# **CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL**

NEW YORK, N.Y.

AS OF RIGHT CONSTRUCTION COST ESTIMATE

SCHEMEA

August 6, 2007

McQuilkin Associates, Inc. Construction Consultants

500 Morris Avenue Springfield, NJ 07081 Tel 973-218-1600 Fax 973-218-1700

. . ......

TT

	LKIN ASSOCIATES INC.			DATE:	8/6/07
	CT: CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL			REV:	
LOCAT	ON: NEW YORK, NY				
CSI #	TRADE SUMMARY		SCHOOL	RESIDENTIAL	TOTAL
					AMOUNT
	AS OF RIGHT - SCHEME A				
02050	BUILDING DEMOLITION		103,500	B-	103,500
02060	SELECTIVE DEMOLITION		25,000		25,000
	ASBESTOS ABATEMENT		NIC	NIC	NIC
	PAVING & SURFACING		24,786	-	24,786
02900	EXCAVATION/FOUNDATION		1,967,652	24,000	1,991,652
03010	CONCRETE AND CEMENT WORK		2,325,900	1,075,600	3,401,500
04200	MASONRY		193,140		193,140
05500	MISCELLANEOUS METALS		95,950	36,500	132,450
06100	ROUGH CARPENTRY		43,500	16,200	59,700
06400	FINISH CARPENTRY		21,720	21,812	43,532
07530	ROOFING & FLASHING			152,625	152,625
07900	JOINT SEALERS		15,000	5,000	20,000
08100	HOLLOW METAL DOORS		19,930	5,890	25,820
08200	WOOD DOORS		13,500	7,250	20,750
08700	HARDWARE		32,800	5,700	38,500
08900	EXTERIOR FACADE		636,176	293,004	929,180
09250	GYPSUM WALLBOARD		295,356	139,228	434,584
09300	TILEWORK		136,946	12,492	149,438
09500	ACOUSTIC CEILING		120,876	1,316	122,192
09600	WOOD FLOORING		8,376	37,992	46,368
09680	CARPET & RESILIENT		38,392	764	39,156
09700	TERRAZZO		181,840	22,920	204,760
	PAINTING		81,224	21,260	102,483
	VISUAL DISPLAY BOARDS		9,750		9,750
10150	COMPARTMENTS & CUBICLES		21,200		21,200
10520	FIRE PROTECTION SPECIALTIES		7,200		7,200
10800	TOILET ACCCESSORIES		21,800	2,600	24,400
11130	PROJECTION SCREENS		18,000		18,000
11400	APPLIANCES		5,000	10,000	15,000
	CONVEYING SYSTEM		150,000	260,000	410,000
15300	FIRE PROTECTION		175,164	71,198	246,362
15400	PLUMBING		365,940	167,238	533,177
15500	HVAC		1,592,400	453,075	2,045,475
16050			926,092	382,905	1,308,997
10000			9,674,109	3,226,568	12,900,677
·····		120/	1,160,893	387,188	1,548,081
	GENERAL CONDITIONS	12%	and the second	Construction of the second	
	SUBTOTAL		10,835,002	3,613,756	14,448,758
	LIABILITY INSURANCE	3%	325,050	108,413	433,463
	TOTAL		11,160,052	3,722,169	14,882,221

ΤT

# **CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL**

NEW YORK, N.Y.

AS OF RIGHT CONSTRUCTION COST ESTIMATE

SCHEME B

August 6, 2007

McQuilkin Associates, Inc. Construction Consultants

500 Morris Avenue Springfield, NJ 07081 Tel 973-218-1600 Fax 973-218-1700

ΤT

	LKIN ASSOCIATES INC.			DATE:	8/6/07
	CT: CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL			REV:	
LOCATI	ION: NEW YORK, NY				
CSI#	TRADE SUMMARY		SCHOOL	RESIDENTIAL	TOTAL AMOUNT
	AS OF RIGHT - SCHEME B				
			a da a 1 1 1 1		
02050	BUILDING DEMOLITION		103,500	-	103,500
	SELECTIVE DEMOLITION		25,000		25,000
and the second se	ASBESTOS ABATEMENT		NIC	NIC	NIC
CONTRACTOR OF STREET	PAVING & SURFACING		24,786	-	24,786
	A Comment of the second s		1,967,652	24,000	1,991,652
	CONCRETE AND CEMENT WORK		2,342,300	1,059,200	3,401,500
and the second se	MASONRY		193,140	······································	193,140
05500	MISCELLANEOUS METALS		89,350	43,100	132,450
same the second the second	ROUGH CARPENTRY	·	38,900	18,700	57,600
	FINISH CARPENTRY		18,570	30,052	48,622
	ROOFING & FLASHING			152,625	152,625
07900	JOINT SEALERS		15,000	5,000	20,000
	HOLLOW METAL DOORS		16,280	8,760	25,040
08200	WOOD DOORS		8,750	10,750	19,500
	HARDWARE		28,150	8,300	36,450
08900	EXTERIOR FAÇADE		636,176	293,004	929,180
	GYPSUM WALLBOARD		234,373	176,722	411,095
09300	TILEWORK		108,022	18,728	126,750
	ACOUSTIC CEILING	/	107,821	2,212	110,033
09600	WOOD FLOORING			51,296	51,296
and the second sec	CARPET & RESILIENT		34,558	1,210	35,768
	TERRAZZO		181,840	22,920	204,760
	PAINTING		72,347	27,864	100,210
	VISUAL DISPLAY BOARDS		5,850	-	5,850
	COMPARTMENTS & CUBICLES		16,400		16,400
	FIRE PROTECTION SPECIALTIES		6,000	-	6,000
	TOILET ACCCESSORIES		16,200	3,900	20,100
The second se	PROJECTION SCREENS		10,800	-	10,800
	APPLIANCES		5,000	15,000	20,000
	CONVEYING SYSTEM		150,000	280,000	430,000
The supervised states and the	FIRE PROTECTION		150,645	95,717	246,362
	PLUMBING		319,352	213,226	532,577
15500				609,105	1,978,605
	ELECTRICAL WORK		796,810	512,187	1,308,997
	SUBTOTAL		9,093,071	3,683,577	12,776,648
	GENERAL CONDITIONS	12%	1,091,169	442,029	1,533,198
	SUBTOTAL		10,184,240	4,125,606	14,309,846
	LIABILITY INSURANCE	3%	305,527	123,768	429,295
···	TOTAL	~~~	10,489,767	4,249,374	14,739,141

T

ŦΤ

# **CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL**

NEW YORK, N.Y.

PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION COST ESTIMATE

**August 6, 2007** 

McQuilkin Associates, Inc.

**Construction Consultants** 

-----

----1<sup>-</sup>

500 Morris Avenue Springfield, NJ 07081 Tel 973-218-1600 Fax 973-218-1700

IΤ

	CT: CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL				
				REV:	
	ION: NEW YORK, NY				
C <b>SI #</b>	TRADE SUMMARY		SCHOOL	RESIDENTIAL	TOTAL
			·····		AMOUNT
	DDODOOFD				
<u></u>	PROPOSED				
02050	BUILDING DEMOLITION		103,500		103,50
	SELECTIVE DEMOLITION		25,000		25,00
	ASBESTOS ABATEMENT		25,000 NIC	NIC	25,000 NI(
	PAVING & SURFACING		24,786	INIC	24,78
	EXCAVATION/FOUNDATION			56,000	
	CONCRETE AND CEMENT WORK		1,967,652		2,023,652
	MASONRY		2,458,700	2,184,560	4,643,260
			193,140	-	193,140
	MISCELLANEOUS METALS ROUGH CARPENTRY		95,950	61,300	157,250
		<u> </u>	43,500	47,200	90,700
	FINISH CARPENTRY	·····	21,720	33,400	55,120
	ROOFING & FLASHING		-	166,680	166,680
	JOINT SEALERS		15,000	10,000	25,000
	HOLLOW METAL DOORS		19,930	17,680	37,610
	WOOD DOORS		13,500	26,000	39,500
	HARDWARE		32,800	17,600	50,400
	EXTERIOR FAÇADE		654,326	737,084	1,391,410
	GYPSUM WALLBOARD		303,236	359,208	662,444
	TILEWORK		136,946	30,960	167,906
	ACOUSTIC CEILING		134,316	4,004	138,320
	WOOD FLOORING		8,376	97,258	105,634
	CARPET & RESILIENT		42,352	2,102	44,454
	TERRAZZO		181,840	22,920	204,760
	PAINTING		82,169	56,934	139,103
	VISUAL DISPLAY BOARDS		9,750	-	9,750
	COMPARTMENTS & CUBICLES		21,200	-	21,200
	FIRE PROTECTION SPECIALTIES		7,200	ىت	7,200
	TOILET ACCCESSORIES		21,800	6,500	28,300
	PROJECTION SCREENS		18,000	-	18,000
	APPLIANCES		5,000	25,000	30,000
4000	CONVEYING SYSTEM		150,000	360,000	510,000
	FIRE PROTECTION		185,724	144,551	330,275
5400	PLUMBING		365,940	331,657	697,597
15 <del>5</del> 00			1,688,400	919,870	2,608,270
6050	ELECTRICAL WORK		981,772	772,178	1,753,950
	SUBTOTAL	··· ··· ··· ··· ··· ··· ··· ··· ··· ·	10,013,525	6,490,645	16,504,170
	GENERAL CONDITIONS	12%	1,201,623	778,877	1,980,500
	SUBTOTAL		11,215,147	7,269,523	18,484,670
		3%	336,454	218,086	554,540
	TOTAL	<u> </u>	11,551,602	7,487,608	19,039,210

# **CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL**

NEW YORK, N.Y.

AS OF RIGHT CONSTRUCTION COST ESTIMATE

SCHEME C

August 6, 2007

McQuilkin Associates, Inc. Construction Consultants

500 Morris Avenue Springfield, NJ 07081 Tel 973-218-1600 Fax 973-218-1700

MC QUI	LKIN ASSOCIATES INC.	DATE	8/6/07
PROJEC	CT: CONGREGATION SHEARITH ISRAEL	REV	
LOCATI	ON: NEW YORK, NY		
CSI#	TRADE SUMMARY		TOTAL
	AS OF RIGHT - SCHEME C		
00050			103,500
	BUILDING DEMOLITION		103,500 NIC
	ASBESTOS ABATEMENT		24,786
	PAVING & SURFACING		And the second state of th
	EXCAVATION/FOUNDATION		1,277,005
	CONCRETE AND CEMENT WORK		2,850,680
	MASONRY	۲	83,358
	MISCELLANEOUS METALS		66,200
	ROUGH CARPENTRY		38,500
	FINISH CARPENTRY		62,128
	ROOFING & FLASHING		180,060
	JOINT SEALERS		5,000
	HOLLOW METAL DOORS		31,120
08200	WOOD DOORS		24,000
08700	HARDWARE		27,200
08900	EXTERIOR FAÇADE		889,180
09250	GYPSUM WALLBOARD		329,067
09300	TILEWORK		36,956
	ACOUSTIC CEILING		9,513
	WOOD FLOORING		106,976
	CARPET & RESILIENT		4,604
	TERRAZZO		22,920
	PAINTING		69,569
	TOILET ACCCESSORIES		6,600
	APPLIANCES		30,000
	CONVEYING SYSTEM		365.000
	FIRE PROTECTION		188,903
	PLUMBING		350,161
	HVAC		1,202,110
	ELECTRICAL WORK		1,003,534
10000	SUBTOTAL		9,388,630
	GENERAL CONDITIONS	12%	1,126,636
		I Z /0	10,515,265
	SUBTOTAL		
	LIABILITY INSURANCE		315,458
	TOTAL		10,830,723

T

ŧΤ

Exhibit B

IΤ

---- r--

-1111

Freeman/Frazier & Associates, Inc. Date : September 6, 2007 Property : 10 West 70th Street Block, Lot : Blk 1122, Lots 36 & 37 Total Land Area : 6,472 sq.ft. Zone : R8B & R10A

# Exhibit B: Comparable Market Rate Community Facility Rents

ADJUSTED <u>PRICE/S.F.</u>	\$38.37	\$49.48	\$42.32	\$38.99	\$38.58	\$29.93	\$39.61	\$40.00
COMPOS FACTOR	0.86	0.81	0.77	0.81	0.86	1.00	Average	1.00
OTHER	06.0	06.0	0.95	06.0	0.95	0.95		1.00
ZONING	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00		1.00
SIZE	1.00	1.00	06.0	0.95	0.95	1.00		1.00
LOCATION	0.95	06.0	0.90	0.95	0.95	1.05		1.00
TIME	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00		1.00
PRICE/ SO.FT.	\$44.88	\$61.09	\$55.00	\$48.00	\$45.00	\$30.00		\$40.00
AREA	500	550	3,000	1,000	1,200	450		
ANNUAL <u>RENT</u>	\$22,440	\$33,600	\$165,000	\$48,000	\$54,000	\$13,500		
DATE	Asking	Asking	Asking	Asking	Asking	Asking		
RENTAL LOCATION	<ol> <li>161 West 86th Street New York, NY Blk 1217 Lot 6</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>125 West 72nd Street New York, NY Blk 1144 Lot 23</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>1700 Broadway New York, NY Blk 1025 Lot 25</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>175 West 79th Street New York, NY Blk 1210 Lot 1</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>163 West 74th Street New York, NY Blk 1146 Lot 104</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>27 West 96th Street New York, NY Blk 1832 Lot 16</li> </ol>		Subject Property 10 West 70th Street New York, NY
								1

TT

Economic Analysis Report 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY September 6, 2007

1044 100 27 West 96th Street 53 9157 ST 161 West 86th Street S, 97<sub>4</sub> 175 West 79th Street 163 West 74th Street 8, 125 West 72nd Street TOIN Sz BOIN 10 West 70th Street S/ A 7.84 \$ bo Sath St SGH 67 ৾৻৻ 500 SI 81 at \$1 ji) Ġ 644 1700 Broadway 594 itchei 5/ 2 5755 ST Sr ¢ Sy W 6

Exhibit B: Comparable Market Rate Community Facilities

Economic Analysis Report 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, New York September 6, 2007

# Exhibit B: Comparable Community Facility Rents

1. 161 West 86<sup>th</sup> Street

This is a 500 sq.ft. shared community facility office for rent. It is located on Manhattan's upper west side between Amsterdam and Columbus Avenues, and is approximately one mile south of the subject property. A -5% adjustment was made for superior location, and a -5% adjustment was made for the current "asking" status, as well as, a -5% adjustment for sharing. No adjustments were made for time, size or zoning.

# 2. 125 West 72<sup>nd</sup> Street

This is a 550 sq.ft. recently renovated shared community facility office for rent. It is located on Manhattan's Upper West side between Amsterdam and Columbus Avenues, and is approximately three blocks away from the subject property. A -10% adjustment was made for superior location, and a -5% adjustment was made for the current "asking" status, as well as, a -5% adjustment for sharing. No adjustments were made for time, size or zoning.

3. 1700 Broadway

This is a 3,000 sq.ft. community facility for rent. It is located between West  $53^{rd}$  and West  $54^{th}$  Streets and is approximately one mile south of the subject property. A -10% adjustment was made for the superior location, and a -10% adjustment was made for the large size. An additional -5% adjustment was made for the current "asking" status of this community facility. No adjustments were made for time or zoning.

## 4. 175 West 79th Street

T

This is a 1,000 sq.ft. shared community facility office for rent. It is located on Manhattan's Upper West Side between Columbus and Amsterdam Avenues, and is approximately nine blocks north of the subject property. A -5% adjustment was made for superior location, and a -5% adjustment was made for the large size. An additional -5% adjustment was made for the current "asking" status, as well as, a -5% adjustment for sharing. No adjustments were made for time or zoning.

Economic Analysis Report 6-10 West 70<sup>th</sup> Street New York, New York September 6, 2007

Exhibit B: Comparable Community Facility Rents

## 5. 163 West 74th Street

This is a 1,200 sq.ft. community facility for rent. It is located on Manhattan's Upper West Side between Columbus and Amsterdam Avenue, and is approximately half a mile north of the subject property. A -5% adjustment was made for superior location, and a -5% adjustment was made for the large size. An additional -5% adjustment was made for the current "asking" status. No adjustments were made for location or zoning.

6. 27 West 96th Street

This is a 450 sq.ft. community facility for rent. It is located on Manhattan's Upper West Side between Amsterdam Avenue and Central Park West, and is approximately 1.7 miles north of the subject property. A +5% adjustment was made for the inferior location relative to the subject property, and a -5% adjustment was made for the current "asking" status of this site. No adjustments were made for time, size or zoning.

····· - TT