## FREEMAN

132 NASSAU STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10038
TEt: 212.732.4056
FAX: 212.732.1442

## FAX TRANSMITTAL

Date: $\quad$ February 2 2, 2008

To: Jeffrey Mulligan + Jed Weiss
Fax Number:
212-788-8769

From:

Re:

No. of Pages:
Jessica Daniels
10 W doth t t Meeting Follow Up

Fax Number:
(212) 732-1442

| $\square$ URGENT | $\square$ FOR REVIEW | $\square$ PLEASE COMMENT |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\square$ AS REQUESTED | $\square$ PLEASE REPLY | $\square$ FOR YOUR INFORMATION |

NOTES/COMMENTS:
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

|  | FRAZ\|ER |
| :---: | :---: |
| real estate services |  |
| 132 nassau street | \&associates,inc. |
| new rork. nr 10038 |  |
| TEL: 21. 2 732.4096 |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

MEMORANDUM
Date : February 22, 2008

To : Jeffrey Mulligan
Jed Weiss
New York City Board of Standards and Appeals
From : Jack Freeman
Re : 6-10 West $70^{\text {th }}$ Street
BSA Meeting Response

Attached please find a letter in response to the BSA meeting of February 20, 2008.

FREEMAN<br>\section*{FRAZ|ER}<br>REAL ESTATE SERVICES<br>132 nassau street<br>NEW YORK, NY 10038<br>TEL: 212.732.40S6<br>FAX: 212.732. 1442<br>\& ASSOCIATES, INC

February 22, 2008

Jeffrey Mulligan, Executive Director
New York City Board of Standards and Appeals
40 Rector Street
New York, New York 10007
Re: $\quad 6-10$ West $70^{\text {th }}$ Street
New York, NY
74-07-BZ
Dear Mr. Mulligan:
Following our meeting on February 20, 2008, we had the chance to review the materials we provided in our previous submissions and December 21, 2007 Response to the Board. Below we provide a summary to highlight the assumptions made for the most recent submission:

The floor area of the As of Right with Tower-was determined by Platt Byard Dovell White's (PBDW) zoning analysisto be $37,888.11$ sq.ft. This served as the basis of our property valuation and As of Right analysis. For your review we have attached is an axonometric drawing of the As of Right with Tower Development and floor area schedule as provided by PBDW (for current discussion purposes, PBDW's $37,888.11$ sq.ft. is more or less consistent with the $+/-36,000$ sq.ft. you described at the meeting; differences can be discussed and resolved with PBDW).

Of the As of Right $37,888.11$ sq.ft., 19,755 (as shown on floor area schedule) is residential square footage, and 18,133 is community facilities area. In our most recent submission, the acquisition cost of $\$ 14,816,000$ was determined based only on the 19,755 sq.ft. of As of Right residential arast $\$ 750 /$ sq.ft. Th previous analyses, the acquisition costs were based on the entire building, which included the community facility areas.

Attached is a copy of page two of the December 21, 2007 Hearing Response submission, which describes the As of Right with Tower Development, as per the above. Schedule A from the same submission (attached), shows the As of Right scheme is not feasible and has a capital loss of $\mathbf{\$ 7 , 0 7 6 , 0 0 0}$.

BSA Hearing Response
6-10 West $70^{\text {th }}$ Street
New York, NY
February 22, 2008
Page 2

The Proposed Development has slightly more floor area, 42,962 sq.ff. of total floor area, of which $14,430 \mathrm{sq} . \mathrm{ft}$. is community facility area, and $20,863 \mathrm{sq} . \mathrm{ft}$. is residential area. As seen in Schedule A, the return is $12.19 \%$. This is somewhat higher than in previous analyses, but is a direct result of the decrease in acquisition costs based on the elimination of the Community Facility floor area requested by the Board. In other variances the Board has accepted increased returns, which result at changes in assumptions made at their request.

As we noted at the meeting, and as shown by the analysis of the As of Right with Tower Development, without the floor area included in the Proposed Development, the project would not be economically feasible. When PBDW completes their analysis of creating a courtyard, we will analyze the effect of the loss of floor area from the courtyard and discuss that with you at next Thursday's meeting.

Please feel free to call me if you have any further questions.
Sincerely,


[^0]
## C) As of Right with Tower Development

The As of Right with Tower Development would occupy the full zoning envelope, and would consist of a new synagogue lobby on the ground floor, and community facility space on floors two through four. Floors five through sixteen would be for sale condominium units. There would be a total of thirteen residential units.

The gross built area of this alternative would be 37,888 sq.ft., not including the cellar. The zoning floor area for this alternative would be 37,888 sq.ft. The total gross residential area, which includes residential lobby and core but does not include the cellar, would be $19,755 \mathrm{sq} . \mathrm{ft}$. The residential sellable area is 10,795 sq. ft .

## D) Proposed Development

The Proposed Development alternative would consist of new construction of an eight-story plus penthouse. The new development consists of a new synagogue lobby on the ground floor, and community facility space on floors two through four. Floors five through eight and the penthouse would be for sale condominium units. There would be a total of five residential units.

The gross built area of this alternative would be 42,962 sq.ft., not including the cellar. The zoning floor area for this alternative would be 42,962 sq. ft . The total gross residential area, which includes residential lobby and core but does not include the cellar, would be 22,907 sq.ft. The residential sellable area is 14,980 sq.ft.

This development program is referred to as the "Proposed Development".

## E) As of Right Residential F.A.R. 4.0 - Scheme C

The "As of Right Residential F.A.R. 4.0" alternative was submitted at the request of the Board based on Notice of Objections of June 15, 2007, Objection \#37. A revised analysis at the request of the Board was performed in the October 24, 2007 submission.

The specifics of this alternative are discussed in Exhibit C.

## Value of the Property

Estimating the acquisition cost is part of every Economic Analysis Report submitted as part of the BSA procedure. For this mixed institutional and residential development, property valuation was estimated assuming complying development after review and analysis of comparable land sales, based on an average $\$ /$ square foot of buildable floor area.

ECONOMIC ANALYSIS
10 WEST 70TH STREET
NEW YORK. NY
DECEMBER 21, 2007
PAGE 11

SCHEDULE A1: ANALYSIS SUMMARY - CONDOMINIUM USE

|  |  | REVISED AS OF RIGHT CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT |  | LESSER <br> VARIANCE CF/RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT |  | AS OF RIGHT WITH TOWER DEVELOPMENT (Residential Only) |  | REVISED <br> PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT <br> (Residential Only) |  | ALL RESIDENTIAL F.A.R. 4.0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| BUILDING AREA (SQ.FT.) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BUILT RESIDENTIAL AREA |  | 7.594 |  | 12.575 |  | 20,019 |  | 20.863 |  | 28,724 |
| SELIABLE AREA | 70\% | 5,316 | 68\% | 8.593 | 76\% | 10,346 | 52\% | 15.799 | 62\% | 17.780 |
| CAPITAL INVESTMENT SUMMARY |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ACQUISITION COST |  | \$14,816.000 |  | \$14,816,000 |  | \$14.816.000 |  | \$14,816,000 |  | \$14.816.000 |
| HOLDING \& PREP. COSTS |  | \$0 |  | \$0 |  | 0 |  | \$0 |  | \$0 |
| BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS |  | \$3.722,000 |  | \$4,339,000 |  | \$8,056,000 |  | \$7.488,000 |  | \$11.808.000 |
| SOFT CONSTRUCTION COSTS |  | \$4,337,000 |  | \$4.525,000 |  | \$6,274.000 |  | \$6,434,000 |  | \$6,847,000 |
|  |  | \$22,875.000 |  | \$23,680,000 |  | \$29,146,000 |  | \$28,739.000 |  | \$33,471,000 |
| PROJECT VALUE |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |


| SALE OF UNITS (less) SALES COMMISSIONS | 6\% | $\begin{gathered} \$ 12,623.000 \\ (\$ 757.000) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 20,191,000 \\ & (\$ 1,211,000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 24.595,000 \\ & (\$ 1,476,000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 40.968,000 \\ & (\$ 2,458.000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 40,199,000 \\ & (\$ 2,412.000) \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| EST. NET PROJECT VALUE |  | \$11,868.000 | \$18,980,000 | \$23,119,000 | \$38.510.000 | \$37.787,000 |


| ACQUISITION COST | \$14,816,000 | \$14.816,000 | \$14,816,000 | \$14.818,000 | \$14.816.000 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| HOLDING \& PREP. COSTS | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| BASE CONSTRUCTION COSTS | \$3.722.000 | \$4,339,000 | \$8,056,000 | \$7,488,000 | \$11.808,000 |
| SOFT CONSTRUCTION COSTS | \$4,337,000 | \$4.525,000 | \$6,274,000 | \$6,434,000 | \$6.847.000 |
| CARRYING COSTS DURING SAL.ES PERIOD | \$470.000 | \$493,000 | \$600,000 | \$664.000 | \$688,000 |
| EST. TOTAL INVESTMENT | \$23,345,000 | \$24,173.000 | \$29,746,000 | \$29,402,000 | \$34,159,000 |
| RETURN ON INVESTMENT |  |  |  |  |  |
| ESTIMATED PROJECT VALUE (less)EST.TOTAL INVESTMENT (less) EST.TRANSACTION TAXES | $\begin{array}{r} \$ 11.866 .000 \\ (\$ 23,345.000) \\ (\$ 230.000) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} \$ 18,980.000 \\ \langle \$ 24,173.000\rangle \\ (\$ 368,000) \end{array}$ | \$23,119,000 (\$29.746.000) (\$449.000) | $\begin{array}{r} \$ 38.510,000 \\ (\$ 29,402,000) \\ (\$ 748,000) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} \$ 37,787,000 \\ (\$ 34,159,000) \\ (\$ 734,000) \end{array}$ |
| EST.PROFIT (loss) | (\$11,709,000) | (\$5,561,000) | (\$7.076.000) | \$8,360,000 | \$2,894,000 |
| DEVELOPMENT/SALES PERIOD (MONTHS) | 23 | 23 | 32 | 28 | 28 |
| ANNUALIZED PROFIT (loss) | (\$6,109.000) | (\$2.901.000) | (\$2.654.000) | \$3.583.000 | \$1,240,000 |
| RETURN ON TOTAL INVESTMENT | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 0.00\% | 28.43\% | 8.47\% |
| ANNUALIZED RETURN ON TOTAL INVESTMENT | $\begin{array}{r} 0.00 \% \\ ===== \pm=. \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 0.00 \% \\ ===ล=ニ= \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 0.00 \% \\ ======= \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 12.19 \% \\ ==\pi==== \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 3.63 \% \\ ====\approx== \end{array}$ |



## 10 WEST 70 th ST.

PLATT BYARD DOVELL WHITE
Architects



[^1]
[^0]:    Jack Freeman

[^1]:    $12619.94 \quad 7497.57$
    5513.60

    17,770.60
    $18,133.54$
    $51,035.24$

